

Request for Action
by
Board of Commissioners

**Approval of Pre-Qualification of Commercial Real Estate Appraisal
and Market Study Firms**

A. SUMMARY

This Request for Action is for authorization for Rhode Island Housing and Mortgage Finance Corporation (“RIHousing”) to establish a roster of commercial real estate appraisal and market study analysis firms to provide industry-standard appraisals and market studies for RIHousing’s multifamily real estate lending programs.

B. DISCUSSION

To conduct its multifamily lending programs, RIHousing engages commercial real estate appraisal firms to provide industry-standard appraisals consistent with the requirements of Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) and market studies consistent with the requirements of the National Council of Housing Market Analysts (NCHMA) Model Content Standards for Market Studies for Rental Housing. The Development Division maintains a roster from which appraisers and/or market study analysts are selected through a Request for Quotation for each development project.

In April, RIHousing issued a Request for Proposals (“RFP”) seeking proposals from qualified firms to engage state-licensed certified general real estate appraisal firms to produce full narrative appraisals and/or market study reports on an as-needed basis for the Real Estate Development Division. The RFP was posted on RIHousing’s website, and the website maintained by the State of Rhode Island Department of Administration, Division of Purchases. In addition, an email notification was sent to the appraisers on the current RIHousing, State, and MassHousing appraiser lists. In response to the RFP, RIHousing received proposals from nine firms, three of which are new to RIHousing. A selection committee comprised of RIHousing staff reviewed the proposals and ranked them based on the criteria set forth in Attachment A. RIHousing seeks approval to engage all of the firms that submitted proposals in response to the RFP, as set forth below:

- Bonz and Company, Inc.
- Foster Appraisal & Consulting Co., Inc.
- Gill Group
- JLL Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC
- Keystone Consulting Group, Inc.
- Kirk & Company, Inc.
- LDS Consulting Group, LLC (Market Study only)
- Novogradac and Company, LLC
- VSI Appraisal Group

Each of the above-listed commercial real estate appraisal firms are qualified and able to support RIHousing's multifamily lending programs.

C. RECOMMENDATION

The attached Resolution is recommended for approval.

D. ATTACHMENT

- A. Commercial Real Estate Appraisal and/or Market Study Firms - RFP 2022 Scoring
- B. Resolution

Multifamily Real Estate Appraisal Firms - RFP 2022 Scoring

Name	Professional capacity	Proposed fee structure	Ability to perform within time & budget	Evaluation of proposed project approach	Previous work experience RIH/similar organizations	Recommendations by reference	Firm minority status/affirmative action program or activities	Other - work samples	Comments	Total Score Rounded	Total Score %	Ranking by score
Response value	20.0%	5.0%	20.0%	15.0%	15.0%	10.0%	10.0%	5.0%		0-80	100%	
Bonz and Company	8.50	7.83	7.75	8.17	8.83	9.00	0.00	8.00	Currently on our list of	58.08	74.92%	2
Foster Appraisal	7.83	7.00	7.00	7.67	7.75	8.00	4.33	7.50	New to RIH	57.08	72.38%	6
Gill Group	8.00	7.40	7.33	7.60	8.20	5.00	7.20	7.80	Currently on our list of	58.53	74.17%	4
JLL Valuation	7.83	7.33	7.25	7.50	8.33	7.00	7.33	7.50	Firm new to RIH; primary contact formerly with Keystone	60.08	75.67%	3
Keystone Consulting	9.00	8.00	7.50	8.60	8.80	9.00	1.00	8.20	Currently on our list of	60.10	77.20%	1
Kirk & Company	8.17	7.83	7.25	8.17	8.83	8.00	1.00	8.00	Currently on our list of	57.25	73.25%	5
Novogradic	7.17	7.17	6.75	7.17	7.67	6.00	6.67	6.17	Currently on our list of	54.75	69.42%	8
VSI Appraisal	7.80	6.80	6.67	7.60	6.00	6.00	1.80	7.40	Currently on our list of	50.07	64.23%	9
LDS Consulting - Market Study Only	7.50	6.83	7.00	6.67	7.33	6.00	8.17	5.00	Market study only	54.50	70.08%	7
For each criteria, you should give a raw score of 1-10. You should consider the following point scale:												
Excellent-10 Very Good- 8/9 Good- 5-7 Fair- 2-4 Poor- 0-1												

Attachment B

Resolution of the Board of Commissioners of Rhode Island Housing and Mortgage Finance Corporation

Whereas, Rhode Island Housing and Mortgage Finance Corporation's ("RIHousing's") enabling act provides it with all of the power to make and execute contracts necessary for the exercise the powers and functions provided to it under that act (R.I. Gen. Laws §42-55-5(6)); and

Whereas, RIHousing has determined that creating a roster of approved commercial real estate appraisal and market study firms to perform appraisals and market studies in connection with its multifamily lending is in the best interests of the corporation; and

Whereas, RIHousing issued a Request for Proposals ("RFP") for commercial real estate appraisal and market study firms; and

Whereas, a selection committee comprised of staff reviewed all proposals and evaluated them in accordance with criteria outlined in the RFP.

NOW THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY:

Resolved, that RIHousing be, and hereby is authorized, to establish the following roster of pre-qualified firms to provide commercial real estate appraisal and market study services as set forth in the Request for Proposals and the proposals submitted in response thereto:

- Bonz and Company, Inc.
- Foster Appraisal & Consulting Co., Inc.
- Gill Group
- JLL Valuation & Advisory Services, LLC
- Keystone Consulting Group, Inc.
- Kirk & Company, Inc.
- LDS Consulting Group, LLC(Market Study only)
- Novogradac and Company, LLC
- VSI Appraisal Group

Resolved, that RIHousing be, and hereby is, authorized to engage the above-listed firms on an as-needed basis; and

Resolved, that this approval with respect to any individual firm is conditional upon the firm's being or becoming duly registered with the R.I. Secretary of

State to do business in Rhode Island, to the extent required by Rhode Island law, prior to contract execution;

Resolved, that the Executive Director, Deputy Executive Director, and Director of Real Estate Development, each acting singly, be and hereby are authorized and empowered to take any and all actions necessary or desirable to carry out the foregoing resolutions, including without limitation the authority to negotiate terms of the engagements as he or she may determine are in the best interests of RIHousing, and to execute any and all agreements or documents as he or she deems necessary to carry out the foregoing.